*** Disclaimer*** The information in this document dates to February 2014 and may not be the most current information available. The document is for informational purposes only and does not constitute legal advice. Please consult an attorney about a particular case, problem, or question.

Payments Fraud Liability Matrix

Prepared by the Federal Reserve Bank of Minneapolis' Payments Information and Outreach Office

February 2014

Payment Type	Subtype (Fraud Type)	Consumer Protection	Legal Authority	Who is liable if cannot recover against fraudster or merchant	Legal Authority
ACH					
	Credit Items (ppd)	\$0 Consumer not liable if they report fraud within 60 days after transmittal of the consumer's periodic statement	Reg. E (12 CFR §205.6(b)(3))	Originating Depository Financial Institution ("ODFI") ¹ is liable for breach of warranty that item is authorized Credit Items can be returned at any time	The ODFI warranty is set forth in NACHA ² OR §2.4.1 Liability for breach of warranty is set forth in NACHA OR §2.4.4 Return deadlines for credit items are set forth in NACHA OR §3.8
	Debit Items (ARC, BOC, IAT, POP and RCK have similar recredit rights pursuant to NACHA OR §§3.11.2.1 – 3.11.2.3) ³	\$0 Consumer not liable if they report fraud within 60 days after transmittal of the consumer's periodic statement	Reg. E (12 CFR §205.6(b)(3)) NACHA OR §3.11.1 Consumer has right of immediate recredit if notifies bank within 15 days after receiving statement	ODFI is liable for breach of warranty that item is authorized ODFI must accept the return of unauthorized items that the Receiving Depository Financial Institution ("RDFI") ⁴ returns within 60 days after the settlement date. Separate warranty claims can be brought after the 60-day period outside of the ACH network	The ODFI warranty is set forth in NACHA OR §2.4.1 Liability for breach of warranty is set forth in NACHA §2.4.4 Return deadlines for debit items are set forth in NACHA OG ⁵ 122 - 123

¹ 2014 NACHA Operating Rules ("OR") 8.63.

² Any reference herein to "NACHA" is specifically to the 2014 NACHA Operating Rules ("OR") & Guidelines ("OG").

³ ARC means lockbox items pursuant to NACHA OR §8.1. POP means Point of Purchase conversion items pursuant to NACHA OR §8.70. BOC refers to Back Office Conversion items pursuant to NACHA OR §8.11. Re-presented check entries (RCK) (NACHA OR §8.75), which means items that are collected via ACH after the original paper check has been dishonored, are not covered by Reg. E as it specifically excludes items that were first originated by a check.

⁴ Receiving Depository Financial Institution. *See* NACHA OR §8.70.

⁵ NACHA Operating Guidelines (2014). The number following OG refers to the page number.

Payment Type	Subtype (Fraud Type)	Consumer Protection	Legal Authority	Who is liable if cannot recover against fraudster or merchant	Legal Authority
Check ⁶					
	Forged (counterfeit) check	\$0 Consumer not liable as the check is not properly payable ⁷ , which means that it was not authorized or not in accordance with any agreement	UCC §4-401. If check is not properly payable, the depository bank must not charge or is required to recredit the amount of the fraudulent check	Paying bank is liable as there is no breach of presentment warranty	Presentment warranties are set forth in UCC §§3- 417 and 4-208
	Forged drawer's signature	\$0 Consumer not liable as the check is not properly payable, which means that it was not authorized or not in accordance with any agreement	UCC §4-401. If check is not properly payable, the depository bank must not charge or is required to recredit the amount of the fraudulent check	Paying bank is liable as there is no breach of presentment warranty	Presentment warranties are set forth in UCC §§3- 417 and 4-208
		Possible exception if consumer's negligence substantially contributed to the forged signature or if consumer's failure to timely report forgery	UCC §3-406 drawer's negligence UCC §4-406 drawer's failure to report		
	Forged endorsement	\$0 Consumer not liable as check is not properly payable, which means that it was not authorized or not in accordance with any agreement	UCC §4-401. If check is not properly payable, the depository bank must not charge or is required to recredit amount of the fraudulent check	Depository bank is liable as there is breach of transfer or presentment warranties	Presentment warranties are set forth in UCC §§3- 417 and 4-208 Transfer warranties are set forth in UCC §§3-416 and 4-207

⁶ These protections also apply to business checks.

⁷ An item is "properly payable" if it is authorized by the customer and is in accordance with any agreement between the customer and bank. UCC §4-401(a).

Payment Type	Subtype (Fraud Type)	Consumer Protection	Legal Authority	Who is liable if cannot recover against fraudster or merchant	Legal Authority
Check					
	Fraudulent Alteration	\$0 Consumer not liable as check is not properly payable, which means that it was not authorized or not in accordance with any agreement	UCC §§3-407 and 4-401. If check is not properly payable, the depository bank must not charge or is required to recredit amount of fraudulent check	Depository bank is liable as there is breach of transfer or presentment warranties	Presentment warranties are set forth in UCC §§3-417 and 4-208 Transfer warranties are set forth in UCC §§3- 416 and 4-207
		Possible exception if consumer's negligence substantially contributed to the alteration or if consumer failed to timely report the alteration	UCC §3-406 drawer's negligence UCC §4-406 drawer's failure to report		
	Remotely Created Checks	\$0 Consumer not liable as check is not properly payable, which means that it was not authorized or not in accordance with any agreement	UCC §4-401. If check is not properly payable, the depository bank must not charge or is required to recredit amount of the fraudulent check	Depository bank is liable for all kinds of fraud for remotely created checks	Reg. CC (12 CFR §229.34(d)) contains transfer and presentment warranties for remotely created checks in which depository bank warrants that the check is authorized

Payment Type	Subtype (Fraud Type)	Consumer Protection	Legal Authority	Who is liable if cannot recover against fraudster or merchant	Legal Authority
Credit Cards ⁸					
	Card Present (signature or Pin required)	\$50 The consumer's maximum liability under federal law is \$50 for unauthorized use	Truth in Lending Act ("TILA") (15 USC §1643(a)) and Reg. Z (12 CFR §226.12(b))	The Issuing Bank is generally liable for fraudulent transactions	Visa and MasterCard Policies ¹⁰
		If the credit card is reported as stolen before it is used by an unauthorized person, then the card issuer cannot hold the customer liable for unauthorized charges.	Ftc.gov ⁹		
		\$0 The consumer has no liability for unauthorized use under Visa/MasterCard consumer policies, provided that the consumer has taken reasonable measures to protect the card and has not acted negligently in failing to timely report the loss	Visa/ MasterCard websites		
		MasterCard has more specific requirements for a customer to have \$0 liability ("Zero Liability" policy) ¹¹ : a. The Cardholder has exercised reasonable care in safeguarding such Card from risk of loss or theft; b. The Cardholder has not reported two or more incidents of unauthorized use to the Issuer in the			

⁸ MasterCard and Visa are used in this document as examples for illustrative purposes only since there are many other credit card companies. If you have specific questions regarding other credit card companies, please consult their websites, policies, and/or terms and conditions.

⁹ Federal Trade Commission consumer fact sheet, LOST OR STOLEN CREDIT, ATM, AND DEBIT CARDS, <u>http://www.consumer.ftc.gov/articles/0213-lost-or-stolen-credit-atm-and-debit-cards</u> (February 25, 2014).

¹⁰ The Visa and MasterCard network rules apply only between the Issuing Bank (the bank that issues cards to cardholders) and the Acquiring Bank (the bank that has the relationship with the merchant). Visa's rules are not public and the legal authority is derived from statements made by Visa and in litigation and from other secondary sources. MasterCard publishes its policies, MASTERCARD RULES (December 13, 2013).

¹¹ MasterCard's "Zero Liability" policy does not apply to MasterCard payment cards: 1) used for commercial, business or agricultural purposes (PLEASE NOTE: Zero Liability does apply to MasterCard credit and debit cards for small businesses); 2) anonymous prepaid cards, such store or gift cards, until such time as the identity of the cardholder has been registered with the financial institution that issued the card; or 3) if a PIN is used for the unauthorized transaction. <u>http://www.mastercard.us/zero-liability.html</u> (February 26, 2014).

	 immediately preceding 12-month period; and c. The account to which Transactions initiated with such Card are posted is in good standing. If a MasterCard customer does not meet these requirements, then a customer is liable for the lesser of \$50 or the amount of money, property, labor, or services obtained by the unauthorized use before notification to the Issuer 			
Card not present (telephone or web initiated use)	\$50 The consumer's maximum liability under federal law is \$50 for unauthorized use	Truth in Lending Act ("TILA") (15 USC §1643(a)) and Reg. Z (12 CFR §226.12(b))	The Acquiring Bank is generally liable for fraudulent transactions if the Acquirer is not able to pass the liability on to the merchant	Visa and MasterCard Policies
	No liability for unauthorized use if credit card number was used, but not the actual card itself	Ftc.gov ¹²	pursuant to the merchant agreement	
	\$0 The consumer has no liability for unauthorized use under Visa/ MasterCard consumer policies, provided that the consumer has taken reasonable measures to protect the card and has not acted negligently in failing to timely report the loss	Visa/ MasterCard websites		
	MasterCard has more specific requirements for a customer to have \$0 liability ("Zero Liability" policy) ¹³ : a. The Cardholder has exercised reasonable care in safeguarding such Card from risk of loss or theft; b. The Cardholder has not reported two or more incidents of unauthorized use to the Issuer in the immediately preceding 12-month period; and			

¹² Federal Trade Commission consumer fact sheet, LOST OR STOLEN CREDIT, ATM, AND DEBIT CARDS, <u>http://www.consumer.ftc.gov/articles/0213-lost-or-stolen-credit-atm-and-debit-cards</u> (February 25, 2014).

¹³ MasterCard's "Zero Liability" policy does not apply to MasterCard payment cards: 1) used for commercial, business or agricultural purposes (PLEASE NOTE: Zero Liability does apply to MasterCard credit and debit cards for small businesses); 2) anonymous prepaid cards, such store or gift cards, until such time as the identity of the cardholder has been registered with the financial institution that issued the card; or 3) if a PIN is used for the unauthorized transaction. <u>http://www.mastercard.us/zero-liability.html</u> (February 26, 2014).

c. The account to which Transactions initiated with such Card are posted is in good standing.		
If a MasterCard customer does not meet these requirements, then a customer is liable for the lesser of \$50 or the amount of money, property, labor, or services obtained by the unauthorized use before notification to the Issuer		

Payment Type	Subtype (Fraud Type)	Consumer Protection	Legal Authority	Who is liable if cannot recover against fraudster or merchant	Legal Authority
Debit Cards					
	Card Present (signature or Pin required)	 \$0 The consumer has no liability for unauthorized use under Visa/MasterCard consumer policies, provided that the consumer has taken reasonable measures to protect the card or has acted negligently in failing to report the loss timely MasterCard has more specific requirements for a customer to have \$0 liability ("Zero Liability" policy)¹⁴: a. The Cardholder has exercised reasonable care in safeguarding such Card from risk of loss or theft; b. The Cardholder has not reported two or more incidents of unauthorized use to the Issuer in the immediately preceding 12-month period; and c. The account to which Transactions initiated with such Card are posted is in good standing. If a MasterCard customer does not meet these requirements, then a customer is liable for the lesser of \$50 or the amount of money, property, labor, or services obtained 	Visa/MasterCard websites	The Issuing Bank is generally liable for fraudulent transactions if merchant has obtained signature or required use of PIN	Visa and MasterCard Rules

¹⁴ MasterCard's "Zero Liability" policy does not apply to MasterCard payment cards: 1) used for commercial, business or agricultural purposes (PLEASE NOTE: Zero Liability does apply to MasterCard credit and debit cards for small businesses); 2) anonymous prepaid cards, such store or gift cards, until such time as the identity of the cardholder has been registered with the financial institution that issued the card; or 3) if a PIN is used for the unauthorized transaction. <u>http://www.mastercard.us/zero-liability.html</u> (February 26, 2014).

by the unauthorized use before notification to the Issuer Visa's Zero Liability Policy only applies to U.Sissued cards and does not apply to ATM transactions, certain commercial card transactions, PIN or other transactions not processed by Visa ¹⁵		
\$0 If the loss or theft is reported immediately and prior to the card being used	Ftc.gov ¹⁶	
Up to \$50 If the consumer provides notice within two business days after learning of the loss of the debit card	Reg. E (12 CFR §205.6(b)(1))	
Up to \$500 If the consumer fails to notify the bank within two business days after learning of loss or theft, but does notify within 60 days after transmittal of the consumer's periodic statement listing the unauthorized withdrawals	Reg. E (12 CFR §205.6(b)(2))	
Unlimited consumer liability for transactions occurring in the period starting 60 days after transmittal of the consumer's periodic statement listing the unauthorized withdrawals and until notice is provided	Reg. E (12 CFR §205.6(b)(3))	

¹⁵ <u>http://usa.visa.com/personal/security/zero-</u>

liability.jsp?ep=v_sym_security&symlinkref=http%3A%2F%2Fwww%2Egoogle%2Ecom%2Furl%3Fsa%3Dt%26rct%3Dj%26q%3D%26esrc%3Ds%2 6frm%3D1%26source%3Dweb%26cd%3D8%26cad%3Drja%26ved%3D0CGcQFjAH%26url%3Dhttp%253A%252F%252Fwww%2Evisa%2Ecom%2 52Fsecurity%252F%26ei%3DFSIOU8K%2DC8qi2wWVo4H4Dg%26usg%3DAFQjCNFD6kkWIkk%2D9EeMjxB59dcm%2DRKlug%26bvm%3Dbv%2E6 1965928%2Cd%2Eb2I#anchor_3 (February 25, 2014).

¹⁶ Federal Trade Commission consumer fact sheet, LOST OR STOLEN CREDIT, ATM, AND DEBIT CARDS, <u>http://www.consumer.ftc.gov/articles/0213-lost-or-stolen-credit-atm-and-debit-cards</u> (February 25, 2014).

Payment Type	Subtype (Fraud Type)	Consumer Protection	Legal Authority	Who is liable if cannot recover against fraudster or merchant	Legal Authority
Debit Cards					
	Card not Present (telephone or web initiated use)	 \$0 The consumer has no liability for unauthorized use under Visa/MasterCard consumer policies, provided that the consumer has taken reasonable measures to protect the card or has acted negligently in failing to report the loss timely MasterCard has more specific requirements for a customer to have \$0 liability ("Zero Liability" policy)¹⁷: a. The Cardholder has exercised reasonable care in safeguarding such Card from risk of loss or theft; b. The Cardholder has not reported two or more incidents of unauthorized use to the Issuer in the immediately preceding 12-month period; and c. The account to which Transactions initiated with such Card are posted is in good standing. 	Visa/MasterCard websites	The Acquiring Bank is generally liable for fraudulent transactions if the Acquirer is not able to pass the liability on to the merchant pursuant to the merchant agreement	Secondary Sources ¹⁹
		If a MasterCard customer does not meet these requirements, then a customer is liable for the lesser of \$50 or the amount			

¹⁷ MasterCard's "Zero Liability" policy does not apply to MasterCard payment cards: 1) used for commercial, business or agricultural purposes (PLEASE NOTE: Zero Liability does apply to MasterCard credit and debit cards for small businesses); 2) anonymous prepaid cards, such store or gift cards, until such time as the identity of the cardholder has been registered with the financial institution that issued the card; or 3) if a PIN is used for the unauthorized transaction. <u>http://www.mastercard.us/zero-liability.html</u> (February 26, 2014).

¹⁹ The card system rules are not publicly available and there is very little hard law on the issue. A number of secondary sources, however, assign the liability to the issuing bank. *See* Arnold S. Rosenberg, "*Better than Cash? Global Proliferation of Debit and Prepaid Cards and Consumer Protection Policy*," 44 Column. J. Transnat'l L. 520, 587 (2006).

	of money, property, labor, or services obtained by the unauthorized use before notification to the Issuer Visa's Zero Liability Policy only applies to U.Sissued cards and does not apply to ATM transactions, certain commercial card transactions, PIN or other transactions not processed by Visa ¹⁸ Up to \$50 If the consumer provides notice within two business days after learning of the	Reg. E (12 CFR §205.6(b)(1))		
	loss of the debit card Up to \$500	Reg. E (12 CFR §205.6(b)(2))		
Decoupled Debit Cards (Cards issued by Institution other than Bank in which consumer maintains an account. Settlement between	Unlimited consumer liability for transactions occurring in the period starting 60 days after transmittal of the consumer's periodic statement listing the unauthorized withdrawals and until notice is provided	§205.6(b)(3))	Under NACHA Rules, the ODFI, which is likely the Card Issuer's bank, is liable for breach of warranty as described above under ACH Debits. The ODFI is likely to pass liability to card issuer	
issuer is through branded payment networks, such as Visa/MasterCard.	\$0 The consumer has no liability for unauthorized use under Visa/MasterCard consumer policies, provided that the consumer has taken reasonable measures to protect the card or has acted		by agreement. Under Payment network rules, it is either the Card Issuer or the Acquiring Bank that is liable depending on	

¹⁸ <u>http://usa.visa.com/personal/security/zero-</u>

liability.jsp?ep=v_sym_security&symlinkref=http%3A%2F%2Fwww%2Egoogle%2Ecom%2Furl%3Fsa%3Dt%26rct%3Dj%26q%3D%26esrc%3Ds%2 6frm%3D1%26source%3Dweb%26cd%3D8%26cad%3Drja%26ved%3D0CGcQFjAH%26url%3Dhttp%253A%252F%252Fwww%2Evisa%2Ecom%2 52Fsecurity%252F%26ei%3DFSI0U8K%2DC8qi2wWVo4H4Dg%26usg%3DAFQjCNFD6kkWIkk%2D9EeMjxB59dcm%2DRKlug%26bvm%3Dbv%2E6 1965928%2Cd%2Eb2I#anchor_3 (February 25, 2014).

Card issuer and	negligently in failing to timely report the	whether it is a card-present
consumer is via ACH		or card not present situation.
debits to consumer's		See above for debit cards.
bank account)	MasterCard has more specific	
	requirements for a customer to have \$0	
	liability ("Zero Liability" policy) ²⁰ :	
	a. The Cardholder has exercised	
	reasonable care in safeguarding such	
	Card from risk of loss or theft;	
	b. The Cardholder has not reported	
	two or more incidents of	
	unauthorized use to the Issuer in the	
	immediately preceding 12-month	
	period; and	
	c. The account to which Transactions	
	initiated with such Card are posted is	
	in good standing.	
	If a MasterCard customer does not meet	
	these requirements, then a customer is	
	liable for the lesser of \$50 or the amount	
	of money, property, labor, or services	
	obtained by the unauthorized use before	
	notification to the Issuer	
	Visa's Zero Liability Policy only applies to	
	U.Sissued cards and does not apply to	
	ATM transactions, certain commercial	
	card transactions, PIN or other	
	transactions not processed by Visa ²¹	

²⁰ MasterCard's "Zero Liability" policy does not apply to MasterCard payment cards: 1) used for commercial, business or agricultural purposes (PLEASE NOTE: Zero Liability does apply to MasterCard credit and debit cards for small businesses); 2) anonymous prepaid cards, such store or gift cards, until such time as the identity of the cardholder has been registered with the financial institution that issued the card; or 3) if a PIN is used for the unauthorized transaction. <u>http://www.mastercard.us/zero-liability.html</u> (February 26, 2014).

²¹ <u>http://usa.visa.com/personal/security/zero-</u>

liability.jsp?ep=v_sym_security&symlinkref=http%3A%2F%2Fwww%2Egoogle%2Ecom%2Furl%3Fsa%3Dt%26rct%3Dj%26q%3D%26esrc%3Ds%2 6frm%3D1%26source%3Dweb%26cd%3D8%26cad%3Drja%26ved%3D0CGcQFjAH%26url%3Dhttp%253A%252F%252Fwww%2Evisa%2Ecom%2 52Fsecurity%252F%26ei%3DFSI0U8K%2DC8qi2wWVo4H4Dg%26usg%3DAFQjCNFD6kkWIkk%2D9EeMjxB59dcm%2DRKlug%26bvm%3Dbv%2E6 1965928%2Cd%2Eb2I#anchor_3 (February 25, 2014).

	Reg. E (12 CFR §205.14(b)(1)(v) and §205.6(b)(1))	
	Reg. E (12 CFR §2014.6(b)(1)(v) and §205.6(b)(2))	
Unlimited consumer liability for transactions occurring in the period	Reg. E (12 CFR §205.14(b)(1)(v) and §205.6(b)(3))	
Consumer has right of immediate recredit under NACHA Rules if notifies its bank within 15 days after receiving statement	NACHA OR §3.11.1	